

EVALUATION OF THE IMPLEMENTATION OF CASHLESS PAYMENTS AS A MEASURE TO PREVENT ILLEGAL FEES IN CLASS IIB CORRECTIONAL INSTITUTIONS IN SLEMAN



¹Wily Nur Fauzi Pratama, ²Naniek Pangestuti

^{1,2}Program Studi Manajemen Pemasarakatan, Politeknik Pengayoman – Indonesia

e-mail:

¹wilyfauzi@gmail.com (*corresponding author*)

²naniekedi14@gmail.com

ABSTRACT

This study aims to evaluate the implementation of a cashless system as an effort to prevent illegal fees at Class IIB Sleman Correctional Institution. The research applies a descriptive qualitative approach, with data collected through interviews, observations, and documentation studies. The analysis is based on the policy implementation theory of Randall B. Ripley and Grace A. Franklin, which emphasizes two perspectives: compliance with established policies and an examination of what occurs during implementation and the factors influencing it. The findings show that the implementation of the cashless system helps improve transparency and efficiency in financial transactions among inmates. However, its effectiveness is still constrained by several factors, including technical issues, overcrowding conditions, limited human resources, and misconduct by certain staff members. Although the implementers generally demonstrate a good level of compliance and understanding of the policy, these obstacles hinder the system from functioning optimally. The study is limited because it focuses only on one correctional institution and does not explore inmates' perceptions in depth. Therefore, future research is recommended to examine the role of digital monitoring systems and expand the research scope to other correctional institutions.

Keywords: *Cashless System; Illegal Fees; Policy Evaluation*

INTRODUCTION

The rapid development of digital technology in the era of globalization has transformed various aspects of society, including governance. The Indonesian government, through Presidential Regulation No. 95 of 2018 on Electronic-Based Government Systems (SPBE), emphasizes the importance of digital transformation to support transparent, accountable, and efficient public services (Arief & Abbas, 2021). In line with this policy, various government agencies, including Prisons (Lapas) or Detention Centres (Rutan), are encouraged to adopt digital innovations to improve administrative performance and reduce maladministration.

One issue that continues to undermine institutional integrity in Lapas/Rutan is the prevalence of illegal fees (pungli). Such practices often involve Lapas/Rutan staff who abuse their authority by demanding illegal fees from inmates in exchange for special treatment or facilities (Damai & Muhammad, 2023). These actions not only violate the rights of inmates but also erode public trust in correctional institutions and hinder the achievement of clean governance (Hasim, 2023). Bureaucratic pathologies, such as bribery, gambling, and extortion, thrive in environments lacking transparency and oversight (Maolani et al., 2022).

In response to these challenges, the Ministry of Law and Human Rights issued Regulation Number 29 of 2017 amending Regulation Number 6 of 2013 on the Rules and Regulations of Correctional Institutions and State Detention Centers. These policies encourage the use of cashless payment systems to minimize the circulation of cash among inmates. Cashless systems, such as the Brizzi electronic card, have been implemented in several correctional institutions to support daily transactions, including telecommunications services (Wartelsuspas) and purchases at cooperatives (Siagian et al., 2022). However, despite these efforts, illegal fees still occur. At the Class IIB Sleman Prison, despite the introduction of a cashless system in collaboration with Bank BRI, cases of illegal levies still occurred, with estimated illegal levies reaching IDR 730 million per year (Detik.com 2024). This shows that the existence of a digital system alone is not sufficient without strict supervision, internal compliance, and accountability mechanisms.

Figure 1
News on Illegal Fees at Sleman Class IIB Prison

**3 Fakta Eks Pejabat Lapas Cebongan
Tersangka Pungli Raup Rp 730 Juta Setahun**

Tim detikJogja - detikJogja
Kamis, 21 Nov 2024 07:01 WIB



Source: detik.com, 2024

The existing literature tends to focus on the technical implementation of digital systems or conceptual analysis of corruption in prisons but lacks empirical evaluation of how cashless systems function as a means of preventing illegal fees in specific institutional contexts. Therefore, there is still a research gap in assessing the effectiveness

of such policies, especially in high-risk environments such as overcrowded correctional institutions. This study aims to evaluate the implementation of a cashless system as an effort to prevent extortion at the Class IIB Sleman Correctional Institution. This study not only explores the impact of the system in reducing the circulation of cash but also identifies implementation challenges and provides recommendations for policy improvements. The findings of this study are expected to contribute to a more transparent, orderly, and accountable correctional system in Indonesia.

LITERATURE REVIEW

Efforts to reform bureaucracy in Indonesia continue to face the challenge of bureaucratic pathology, namely various forms of misconduct within government organizations that contradict the principles of ethics, professionalism, and legal provisions. Sondang P. Siagian (1994) states that bureaucratic pathology encompasses five main types: erroneous perceptions and managerial styles, low human resource capacity, legal violations by bureaucrats, dysfunctional behavior, and weak internal conditions that affect public services. These deviations have the potential to undermine the integrity and effectiveness of institutions, including in the context of correctional institutions.

Previous research has proven that bureaucratic pathology has an impact on the decline in the quality of public services and the increase in corrupt practices, including illegal levies. Setyasih, (2023), through a study at the Population and Civil Registration Office of Cianjur Regency, revealed that the lack of transparency in bureaucratic procedures is the main trigger for public dissatisfaction and declining trust in the government. Similar findings were reported by Mohi et al. (2023) in their study at the Sumalata Subdistrict Office, which found that low employee knowledge and discipline directly contributed to bureaucratic law violations. At a broader level, Maolani et al. (2022) showed that a bureaucratic culture that is permissive of extortion and complicated procedures has become a major obstacle to effective public service delivery.

The phenomenon of extortion in correctional institutions adds to the complexity of bureaucratic problems. A study by Damai & Muhammad (2023) shows that extortion in the form of selling cells, communication access fees, and special treatment still occurs in various prisons due to weak supervision, low integrity of officers, and high pressure due to overcapacity. This issue is further exacerbated by inmates' lack of awareness of their rights and the lack of transparency in the service system. One approach being implemented to reduce cash circulation and minimize the potential for extortion is a cashless transaction system.

The implementation of cashless policies as a transaction tool in correctional facilities has been the subject of various studies. Imandeka & Muhammad (2021) evaluated the implementation of virtual currency at the Class I Detention Centre in Depok and found that this system could facilitate the fulfillment of inmates' social needs, although it was still hindered by limited facilities and system integration. Similarly, Dewi et al. (2023) in their study at the Mataram Class III Women's Prison, stated that the use of TapCash was effective in preventing cash circulation and reducing the potential for abuse of authority. However, technical challenges such as signal disruptions and low digital literacy posed significant obstacles.

Furthermore, Azed et al. (2023) researched the effectiveness of the Cash-Free Policy (BPU) in preventing the circulation of narcotics at the Muara Sabak Class IIB Narcotics Prison. Although the policy has been implemented, they found that various violations still occur due to weak supervision and a lack of understanding among staff regarding the policy mechanisms. These findings underscore the importance of

strengthening policy implementation and evaluation, especially at the implementation stage.

Policy evaluation is an important element in understanding the extent to which implementation is in line with objectives. Nugroho (2008) explains that policy evaluation must cover the substance, implementation process, and impact on policy objectives. In the context of correctional institutions, the evaluation focused on the effectiveness of the cashless system implementation in preventing extortion and increasing transparency. This approach aligns with Samodra Wibawa (1994) perspective, which emphasizes the importance of assessing the policy implementation process and its actual impact on society.

Ripley & Franklin (1986). This theory views implementation from two approaches: compliance (adherence to policy) and what's happening and why. (analysis of the process and factors influencing implementation). Compliance encompasses the behavior and understanding of implementers regarding the content of the policy, while the second approach encompasses five main indicators, namely the number of actors involved, clarity of objectives, program complexity, participation of government units, and uncontrollable factors that influence implementation.

In this context, the cashless system at Sleman Class IIB Prison, as regulated in Permenkumham No. 29 of 2017, needs to be evaluated based on these approaches. Using the evaluative approach of Ripley and Franklin, this study aims to identify the extent to which implementers understand and comply with the policy, as well as to uncover the factors that support or hinder the implementation of this system in preventing extortion in the correctional environment.

METHOD

Qualitative research methods with a descriptive field approach are appropriate for exploring issues surrounding the implementation of cashless transaction systems as a means of preventing illegal levies at the Class IIB Sleman Correctional Institution. This method was chosen because it allows researchers to gain a deep understanding of the social dynamics occurring in the field, including the behaviour of correctional officers, the responses of inmates, and the structural and technical challenges that arise in the implementation of the cashless system. Through this approach, researchers can explain in detail the process of policy implementation and uncover the meaning behind everyday practices that are not always explicitly apparent. The analysis in this study includes an in-depth understanding of the cashless system implementation process, the extent to which implementers comply with policy procedures, and the factors that support and hinder its implementation.

Data was obtained from semi-structured interviews, non-participant observation, and document analysis, with informants selected from correctional officers directly involved in the implementation and inmates using the system. The data obtained were then analysed using Miles and Huberman's interactive analysis model, which involves data reduction, data presentation, and drawing conclusions. The conceptual framework of this study refers to Ripley & Franklin (1986) policy implementation theory, which emphasizes two main dimensions: compliance with policy and analysis of what happens in the field and its causal factors.

With this framework, the study not only assesses the extent to which the cashless system is implemented according to procedure but also identifies various technical and social obstacles that affect its effectiveness. This understanding is important for

formulating strategies to improve the quality of correctional services that are more transparent and free from illegal fees.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

The evaluation of the implementation of a cashless system as an effort to prevent illegal levies at the Class IIB Sleman Correctional Institution was analysed using the theory of Randall B. Ripley and Grace A. Franklin. This theory contains two main approaches and seven indicators used to assess the success of a policy implementation. In this study, the analysis was conducted by combining the findings from interviews and field observations, thereby obtaining a factual picture that could be compared with the concepts in the theory. Through this approach, the researchers examined the extent to which the implementation of the cashless system at the Sleman Correctional Institution was in line with the policy implementation approach developed by Randall B. Ripley and Grace A. Franklin.

Within the framework of policy implementation evaluation based on the theory of Ripley & Franklin (1986), the compliance approach plays a crucial role in assessing the extent to which policy implementers adhere to established standards and procedures. In the context of implementing the cashless system at Sleman Class IIB Prison, the research findings indicate that the behavior of policy implementers generally reflects a high level of compliance with applicable regulations, particularly Minister of Law and Human Rights Regulation No. 29 of 2017 on Amendments to Minister of Law and Human Rights Regulation No. 6 of 2013 on the Code of Conduct for Correctional Institutions and State Detention Centers. Transactions by inmates have been conducted using Brizzi cards linked to the Bank BRI system, and implementers consistently ensure that the maximum balance does not exceed the limit of Rp1,000,000, as stipulated in the regulations. Additionally, institutional collaboration with Bank BRI demonstrates structural compliance with central policies, as well as a response to the needs of inmates and their families regarding ease of access and fund transfers. However, the analysis also revealed that during the initial transition period, gaps in compliance were still found in the form of limited cash usage and the misuse of Brizzi cards as a means of extortion by certain staff members. These findings indicate that although the cashless system has been implemented, compliance among implementers is not yet fully consistent, and there are still deviant practices reflecting bureaucratic pathology, namely legal violations by bureaucrats who abuse their authority for personal gain (Damai & Muhammad, 2023).

The understanding of policy implementers is an important aspect that supports the success of implementation, because a comprehensive understanding of the content, objectives, and procedures of the policy enables implementers to translate it into concrete practices appropriately. Research findings indicate that staff at Sleman Class IIB Prison, particularly those involved in the registration process and management of Brizzi cards, have a good understanding of the cashless payment system mechanism, from cash receipt and fund disbursement to cooperative accounts, card procurement, and the determination of administrative fees. Beyond technical aspects, their understanding also encompasses the policy's substance, namely creating a safer, more orderly, and corruption-free system. This awareness is reflected in initial detention procedures, where staff proactively inform detainees that cash is no longer accepted and Brizzi cards must be used as the official transaction tool. Strong understanding among implementers not only impacts operational consistency but also contributes to the education of inmates and facilitates the transition to a cashless system. However, cases of misconduct during the early stages of implementation indicate that technical understanding can be misused if

not accompanied by integrity and strict oversight. Good understanding must be balanced with continuous socialization and effective internal controls to prevent it from being exploited for personal gain (Dewi et al., 2023). Therefore, it can be concluded that the indicators of understanding among implementers in the implementation of the cashless system policy have been well met at Sleman Class IIB Prison, both from a technical and normative perspective, although strengthening of integrity and oversight systems is still needed to ensure the policy's sustainability runs optimally.

Within the framework of policy implementation evaluation based on the theory of Ripley & Franklin (1986) the approach and 'what's happening and why?' are used to analyze the processes and factors influencing implementation. The involvement of multiple actors in policy implementation is a crucial factor determining its success, where coordination, clear roles, and shared commitment are key elements. The research findings indicate that the implementation of the cashless system at Sleman Class IIB Prison involves various sections, such as registration and security, with specific and complementary roles. Each section has strategic functions, ranging from the issuance of Brizzi cards and monitoring their use to controlling transactions. The security team, for example, verifies cards before inmates make purchases as a preventive measure against misuse. Additionally, the prison director plays a crucial role in ensuring the system's sustainability through direct supervision, enforcement of violations, and fostering the integrity of staff. This is in line with the findings of Hanum & Suryawati (2021), emphasize that the successful implementation of policies is highly dependent on the involvement of many well-coordinated actors. This collaborative work system has become the main foundation for maintaining the orderly implementation of the cashless system and preventing illegal levies within the prison environment.

Clarity of objectives is key to the successful implementation of a policy, as specific and well-understood objectives minimize misinterpretation in the field. Research at the Sleman Class IIB Prison shows that the cashless system has a clear objective, namely to eliminate the circulation of cash and prevent illegal levies. Staff members understand that this system is not merely a technical change in transaction methods but a strategic effort to establish orderly and transparent financial management. This understanding encompasses technical aspects, such as the use of Brizzi cards and maximum balance limits, as well as normative aspects, including transaction monitoring and protection of inmates. This clarity strengthens the consistency of implementation and facilitates the socialization process of the policy, both to staff and inmates, thereby reducing resistance to change. This finding is in line with the research by Imandeka & Muhammad (2021), which emphasizes the importance of clarity of purpose in the application of virtual money in detention centers to avoid the circulation of illegal money. Therefore, the cashless system at Sleman Class IIB Prison can be said to be successful in terms of clarity of purpose, as it is able to encourage more orderly, accountable, and minimally deviant policy implementation.

The development and complexity of the program are factors that can influence the effectiveness of policy implementation, including the implementation of the cashless system at Sleman Class IIB Prison. This study found that although the system has been running smoothly, there are still technical challenges such as failures in topping up Brizzi card balances due to the use of non-BRI platforms and network disruptions that slow down transactions. This complexity adds to the workload of staff and creates uncertainty for inmates and their families. The proposed solution is to restrict fund transfers to official prison accounts and BRI Bank accounts only, ensuring more stable, faster, and easier-to-monitor transactions. Additionally, staff responsiveness in addressing technical issues

should be improved through direct coordination with the bank. These findings align with Dewi et al. (2023) research, which noted that signal disruptions and system failures are also major obstacles in the implementation of TapCash at the Mataram Women's Prison. Therefore, simplifying technical processes and restricting transactions to official banking systems are key to addressing complexities, enhancing efficiency, and ensuring the cashless system is implemented in a more orderly and transparent manner.

The implementation of the cashless system at Sleman Class IIB Prison demonstrates active participation from various government units and external institutions. This policy is not only carried out by one internal unit but involves close collaboration between the prison, Bank BRI as the provider of Brizzi cards, the prison's internal cooperative as the distributor of goods and shopping system, and Inkopasindo as the national institution coordinating cooperatives across all prisons in Indonesia. This cross-sectoral synergy supports the efficient and transparent operationalization of the cashless payment system and strengthens the financial management of inmates to prevent misuse. This finding aligns with Hanum & Suryawati (2021), who emphasize that the success of cashless programs is significantly influenced by cross-unit government participation. Therefore, the success of the cashless system at Sleman Prison is not only determined by the internal readiness of the institution but also by the effectiveness of inter-institutional cooperation in creating an integrated and accountable public service ecosystem.

The implementation of the cashless system at Sleman Class IIB Prison faces various external factors that cannot be fully controlled but significantly impact the effectiveness of policy implementation. One of the main obstacles is overcapacity, which is 42.25% above the ideal capacity, triggering social tensions and practices such as debt collection and extortion. In addition, a surge in transactions at certain times, such as holidays, puts a strain on the holding account system and hinders the smooth flow of transactions.

Table 1
Data on the Number of Inmates at Sleman Class IIB Prison

Category	Convicts	Detainees	Capacity
Number (person)	204	62	187

Source: Class IIB Sleman Prison, 2025

The limited number of staff serving as Brizzi administrators exacerbates the situation, especially during leave periods or operational disruptions. System vulnerabilities are also evident in the misuse of Brizzi cards by other inmates, as well as the risk of physical damage to cards that are difficult to replace quickly. These factors reflect the complexity that needs to be addressed through technical evaluations, such as scheduling purchases, adding administrators, strengthening supervision, assigning identities to cards, and enforcing strict penalties for violators. These findings align with the research by Damai & Muhammad (2023), which identified overcapacity, inadequate supervision, and limited human resources as barriers to policy implementation in correctional institutions. Therefore, efforts to strengthen the system and adaptively respond to external factors are key to maintaining the integrity and effectiveness of the cashless system as a strategy to prevent extortion.

Although the cashless transaction system at the Sleman Class IIB Correctional Facility has been implemented as an effort to create a more transparent and bribe-free environment, its implementation still faces various obstacles that require further

evaluation and handling. The following are the main issues identified during the policy implementation evaluation process.

One of the main obstacles in implementing a cashless system is technical issues, including system disruptions during the Brizzi balance top-up process, especially when done through non-BRI platforms such as DANA or ShopeePay. These issues cause the balance not to be credited to the card even though the funds have been deducted from the sender, creating uncertainty for residents. Additionally, the slow response from the bank when disruptions occur further exacerbates the situation. Physical damage to Brizzi cards, such as broken chips due to negligence, is also a serious issue because the card replacement process takes a very long time. To address this, comprehensive education is needed for inmates on the importance of maintaining their Brizzi cards and providing card protectors to prevent damage, given that the replacement process takes a long time.

The number of inmates exceeding the ideal capacity poses a major challenge to the effectiveness of the cashless system. Overcrowding leads to long queues during transactions at the cooperative, increasing the potential for misuse of Brizzi cards by unauthorized parties. Practices such as lending cards among inmates for debt-related purposes and illegal transactions weaken the integrity of the system. Overcapacity also makes supervision by staff more difficult. Solutions to these issues include implementing a queue system based on residential blocks, assigning personal identifiers to each Brizzi card, and increasing the frequency of card checks by staff before transactions are conducted. Enforcement of penalties for card misuse is also necessary to maintain order in the use of the cashless system.

Although the system has been formally socialized and implemented, there are still loopholes for abuse by unscrupulous officers. One case shows that the system was manipulated by officers who took advantage of their personal relationships with inmates to allow cash transactions and use other inmates' Brizzi cards to collect illegal fees. These violations occur due to weak internal oversight and a lack of integrity among some policy implementers. Such violations must be addressed firmly, accompanied by administrative and legal sanctions. Additionally, direct cash deposits should be restricted, with all fund transfers required to be made through the prison's official account. This effort is crucial to closing loopholes for illegal fees and strengthening transparency in the management of inmates' funds.

The implementation of Brizzi top-ups at the Class IIB Sleman Prison still relies on a single officer, which could hinder services when that officer is unavailable. This dependency causes delays in top-ups, affecting inmates' activities such as shopping or meeting basic needs. To make the system more efficient and stable, more than one officer should be appointed as top-up administrators with access and authority to handle transactions. Adding administrators can also strengthen accountability because the top-up process will be supervised by more than one party. This way, the cashless system can run more smoothly and not be disrupted by personal constraints, thereby increasing trust in the policies implemented.

CONCLUSION AND SUGGESTION

This study shows that the implementation of the cashless system at Sleman Class IIB Prison has been carried out in accordance with policy regulations, particularly in the use of Brizzi cards as a cashless transaction medium that replaces the circulation of cash. Policy implementers demonstrate a high level of compliance with regulations and a good understanding of the procedures and objectives of the policy. The clarity of the system's objectives, support from various internal prison units, and collaboration with external

partners such as Bank BRI and cooperatives have been key factors in the implementation of this policy. However, the effectiveness of the system still faces challenges such as technical issues during the top-up process, overcrowding of inmates, limited human resources, and potential misconduct by certain staff members. The complexity of the policy and external factors that cannot be fully controlled indicate that the success of the digital system is not only determined by technology but also by the integrity of implementers, a strong monitoring system, and adaptive operational management.

Based on these findings, several important recommendations are proposed to strengthen the implementation of the cashless system. Active and ongoing outreach to inmates' families regarding the money transfer mechanism should be enhanced, ensuring that funds are only transferred through official prison accounts and avoiding the use of non-BRI platforms that are prone to disruptions, as well as no longer accepting cash deposits. The identity of Brizzi cards also needs to be clarified, for example by printing the owner's name on the card and providing card protectors to prevent damage, given that the replacement process takes a long time. Additionally, the shopping queue system should be scheduled on a rotating basis between residential blocks to reduce overcrowding and prevent card misuse, with strict supervision by security personnel. Strict penalties for card misuse and staff misconduct must be enforced without exception to maintain system integrity.

On the other hand, it is also important to increase the number of Brizzi admin staff to ensure that the top-up process runs smoothly even during staff rotation or leave. For this reason, further research is recommended to explore the role of technology-based supervision in preventing misconduct and to delve deeper into the experiences of residents in accessing cashless transaction services to ensure that this policy truly addresses needs and upholds principles of fairness and rights protection.

REFERENCES

- Arief, A., & Abbas, M. Y. (2021). *Kajian Literatur (Systematic Literature Review): Kendala Penerapan Sistem Pemerintahan Berbasis Elektronik (SPBE).* 8(1), 1–6.
- Azed, A. B., Abdullah, M. Z., & Rahman, J. (2023). *Efektivitas Kebijakan Bebas Peredaran Uang (BPU) Dalam Mencegah Peredaran Narkotika Berdasarkan Pasal 5C Permenkumham No. 29 Tahun 2017 di Lembaga Pemasyarakatan Narkotika Kelas IIB Muara Sabak.* 15(2), 197–203. <https://doi.org/10.33087/legalitas.v15i2.505>
- Damai, S. A., & Muhammad, A. (2023). Transformasi Menuju Pemasyarakatan Bersih: Penyebab & Upaya Pemberantasan Pungutan Liar (Pungli) Di Lingkungan Lembaga Pemasyarakatan. *Jurnal Hukum Dan Kewarganegaraan*, 1(4).
- DetikJogja, T. (2024). *Fakta Eks Pejabat Lapas Cebongan Tersangka Pungli Raup Rp 730 Juta Setahun Baca Artikel Detikjogja, "3 Fakta Eks Pejabat Lapas Cebongan Tersangka Pungli Raup Rp 730 Juta Setahun" Selengkapnya*
- Dewi, Y. K., Karyati, S., & Sukarno, I. G. (2023). Implementasi Tapcash Berdasarkan Surat Edaran Nomor Pas- 09.Hh.01.04 Tahun 2021 Tentang Penggunaan Alat Tukar Khusus Dalam Bentuk Virtual Di Lembaga Pemasyarakatan (Studi Kasus Di Lembaga Pemasyarakatan Perempuan Kelas III MATARAM). *Unizar Recht Journal*, 2(3).
- Hanum, A. F., & Suryawati, R. (2021). *Evaluasi Implementasi Program E-Warong KUBE-PKH di Kabupaten Sukoharjo (Studi Kasus di Kecamatan Mojolaban).* 1, 203–218.
- Hasim, D. (2023). Patologi Birokrasi dalam Pelayanan Publik. *Jurnal Governance And Politics (JGP)*, 3, 9–13.
- Imandeka, E., & Muhammad, A. (2021). Analisis Penerapan Uang Virtual Sebagai Alat

- Tukar Dalam Pemenuhan Kebutuhan Di Rutan Kelas I Depok. *Journal of Correctional Issues*.
- Maolani, D. Y., Sari, A. P., Amalia, A., & Octavelia, C. O. (2022). Patologi birokrasi dan upaya pencegahannya untuk menciptakan birokrasi yang efisien. *Jurnal DIALEKTIKA : Jurnal Ilmu Sosial*, 19(1), 47–56.
- Mohi, W. K., Suprpto, S., & Yusuf, L. (2023). Bureaucratic Pathology In Sumalata District Office , North Gorontalo Regency. *International Journal Papier Public Review*, 4(1), 34–39.
- Nugroho, D. R. (2008). *Public Policy*. PT Elex Media Komputindo.
- Ripley, R. B., & Franklin, G. A. (1986). *Implementation and Bureaucracy*. Brooks/Cole.
- Samodra Wibawa, Y Prabuningrat, A. P. (1994). *Evaluasi Kebijakan Publik*. Raja Grafindo Persada.
- Setyasih, E. T. (2023). Creating an Effective Bureaucracy by Bureaucratic Pathology in Local Governments. *International Journal Publishing INFLUENCE: International Journal of Science Review*, 5(1), 137–143.
- Siagian, P. A. A., Agustina, R., & Sari, A. N. (2022). Strategi Penerapan Konsep Green Economy dan Budaya Cashless Pada Objek Wisata Grand Maerakaca Kota Semarang. *Journal of Indonesian Sharia Economics*, 1(September), 171–188.
- Siagian, S. P. (1994). *Patologi Birokrasi. Analisis, Identifikasi Dan Terapinya*. Ghalia Indoensia.